A review of principled eclecticism for creating a checklist of principled eclectic Chinese language teaching

Qiao-Yu Cai

1 Affiliation not available

April 25, 2024

Abstract

Blended teaching has emerged as a trend in the digital learning environments of the post-COVID-19 era. In recent years, discussions on 'principled eclecticism' have arisen in the field of foreign language education. Principled eclecticism advocates for teachers to integrate various teaching methods, techniques, and strategies, tailoring them to learners' goals, needs, and situations to create diverse and flexible foreign language classes. Learner-centered diversified teaching not only aligns with the concept of hybrid teaching in the post-COVID-19 pandemic era but also coincides with the 'teaching in accordance with aptitude' (yìncáishǐjìao) advocated in Confucius' thought. A literature review revealed that 'principled eclecticism' was proposed in 2000 and has been discussed in the context of English teaching. This study employed Boolean Logic to search for relevant Chinese and English terms in major academic research databases (Taiwan's online Airiti Library, ERICDATA, National Digital Library of Theses and Dissertations in Taiwan, China Academic Journals Full-text Databas (CJFD), China Masters’ Theses Full-text Database (CMFD), China Dissertations Database, EBSCOhost, ProQuest and ERIC- Education Resources Information Center), however, very little discussion on the application of principled eclecticism in the Chinese language teaching. A systematic literature review on the core concepts of principled eclecticism in foreign language education has been conducted in this study to fill the knowledge gap in Chinese language teaching research and practice. Applying principled eclecticism, this study has also developed a lesson plan, taking 'Wàngzhúchénglóng Wàngchénghéngfēng' (Hope children will have a bright future) as an example, for Chinese language teaching, as well as a checklist with 22 items for principled eclectic Chinese language teaching that can be applied in future research and practice.

Keywords

principled eclecticism, Chinese language teaching, principled eclectic Chinese language teaching

1 Introduction

In the digital learning environments of the post-COVID-19 era, blended teaching has emerged as a prevailing trend. Recent discourse in the domain of foreign language education has introduced the concept of 'principled eclecticism,' advocating for the integration of varied teaching methodologies, techniques, and strategies. This approach aims to tailor education to the diverse goals, needs, and situations of learners, thereby enhancing the flexibility and diversity of foreign language instruction. Such learner-centered and diversified teaching methods align not only with the contemporary model of hybrid teaching, necessitated by the post-COVID-19 pandemic era, but also resonate with the ancient Chinese educational philosophy of 'teaching in accordance with aptitude' (因材施教), as advocated by Confucius.

A comprehensive review of the pertinent literature indicates that the term 'principled eclecticism' was first proposed in the early 2000s (Larsen-Freeman & Anderson, 2011; Mellow, 2000, 2002) and has since been predominantly discussed within the context of English language teaching. Yan, et al. (2007) discovered that 81.3% of English language educators at Chinese universities endorse the principled eclecticism approach.
Interviews conducted as part of their research further elucidated that principled eclecticism significantly benefits students’ English language learning, particularly in enhancing vocabulary, listening, and reading skills. Valledor et al. (2023) substantiated that diverse teaching methods exert both similar and distinct impacts on learners’ acquisition of English, with communicative language teaching, the audio-lingual method, and task-based language teaching enhancing communication skills; content and language integrated learning facilitating the absorption of English content knowledge; and whole language teaching improving learners’ proficiency in contextual English usage. However, Rakrak (2022) cautions against the indiscriminate combination of teaching approaches without a theoretical or research-based foundation, as it may negatively affect students’ writing skills.

Utilizing Boolean Logic, this study conducted a comprehensive search across major academic research databases—including Taiwan’s online Airiti Library, ERICDATA, the National Digital Library of Theses and Dissertations in Taiwan, the China Academic Journals Full-text Database (CJFD), the China Masters’ Theses Full-text Database (CMFD), the China Dissertations Database, EBSCOhost, ProQuest, and the Education Resources Information Center (ERIC)—to investigate the application of principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching. The search revealed a notable paucity of discussion on this subject. Hence, this study endeavors to bridge the knowledge gap in Chinese language teaching research and practice by conducting a systematic literature review on the core concepts of principled eclecticism in foreign language education. Furthermore, it develops a lesson plan example for Chinese language teaching, along with a checklist for principled eclectic Chinese language teaching, intended for application in future research and practice.

2 The Origins and Development of Principled Eclecticism in Teaching

The precursor to what is now known as “principled eclecticism” in teaching was initially referred to as the “eclectic approach,” originating in the United States during the 1970s. At that time, the dominant paradigms in foreign language education were structured around the grammar-translation method, the direct method, and the audio-lingual method, each representing different educational philosophies: constructivism, direct instruction, and behaviorism, respectively. Given that foreign language acquisition is an active process of construction, where learners build understanding through personal experience and interpretation, it became evident that integrating multiple teaching methodologies could leverage the strengths and mitigate the limitations of each approach. Pioneers in the application of this integrated approach, such as language education experts Sweet and Palmer, combined direct teaching methods with explanations of grammar and translation, setting the stage for the eclectic method (Boswell, 1972; İşcan, 2017). This initiated a trend where language teachers, based on their professional judgment and consideration of the diverse and complex factors influencing the language classroom, began to integrate various teaching methods into their practice.

However, as the German philosopher Kant articulated, ”Theory without practice is empty; practice without theory is blind.” This cautionary perspective reflects the challenges encountered in the practical application of eclectic teaching. Misinterpretations of the eclectic approach led some educators to haphazardly combine teaching methods without a foundational theoretical or empirical basis, resulting in disorganized and ineffective instruction. This issue was particularly pronounced when teachers lacked sufficient expertise, making it difficult to maximize the benefits of any single teaching method and contributing to a sense of inadequacy within the profession (Weideman, 2001). Consequently, the concept of principled eclecticism in teaching emerged, advocating for a systematic integration and utilization of the strengths of different teaching methods, tailored to the goals, needs, characteristics, and contexts of learners. This conceptual evolution sparked a significant body of scholarly inquiry into the principles of eclecticism in foreign language education (Alharbi, 2017; Collins, 2004; Cushing-Leubner & Bigelow, 2014; Ironsi, 2020; Mason, 2023; Mellow, 2002; Min, 2009; Paramboor, 2015; Rakrak, 2022; Tabiri, 2016), laying the groundwork for future research and practice in this area.

3 The Significance and Application of Principled Eclecticism in Teaching: An Overview

3.1 An overview of the significance
Larsen-Freeman & Anderson (2011) conceptualizes principled eclecticism in teaching as a coherent and diverse approach to target language learning, wherein activities are designed and implemented based on the focal points of language learning rather than solely from the perspective of the target language’s characteristics, such as vocabulary and grammar. This approach acknowledges that foreign language learners' motivations, experiences, and objectives vary due to internal and external factors (Cai, 2022; Dizon & Thanyawatpokin, 2021; Pasban & Narafshan, 2020; Peng et al., 2022), necessitating course designs and implementations that are congruent with these characteristics and needs. Principled eclecticism in teaching, therefore, involves instructing learners on topics directly relevant to them and guiding them through learning tasks in a meaningful learning environment that effectively facilitates the acquisition of target language knowledge and skills.

Three key elements are essential for the effective application of principled eclecticism in foreign language classrooms: the teacher's professional autonomy and ability to apply knowledge usefully; an understanding of learners' experiences and cultural backgrounds coupled with an assessment of their strengths and needs; and the adoption of appropriate teaching methods based on instructional content to create authentic and useful language use contexts (Cushing-Leubner & Bigelow, 2014). Mellow (2002) asserts that the design of classroom activities within the principled eclecticism framework should carefully consider the coherence and gradual progression of language forms and functions. For example, after teaching a grammatical concept, appropriate contexts must be provided for learners to practice and apply this knowledge, ultimately enabling them to use what they have learned in real-life situations. In the classroom, the role of the teacher is that of a facilitator, while students are active participants in the learning process (Mwanza, 2017). The teaching strategies employed include enhancing learning opportunities, fostering communicative interaction, reducing cognitive disparities, stimulating learning perception, cultivating linguistic awareness, contextualizing language input, integrating language skills, promoting learner autonomy, increasing cultural awareness, and ensuring societal relevance (Cushing-Leubner & Bigelow, 2014; Kumaravadivelu, 2006; Rian, 2016). In terms of instructional materials and methods, the characteristics of the grammar-translation method, such as explaining new vocabulary and syntactic points according to learners' levels, are suitable for teaching new words, sentence patterns, and text-based lessons (Mellow, 2002). The audio-lingual method focuses on practicing pronunciation, vocabulary, phrases, and sentence patterns through repeated exercises to habitualize the use of the target language (Mellow, 2002), making it ideal for practicing new words, sentences, dialogues, and substitution drills within the course material. The direct method emphasizes teaching in the target language to immerse learners fully in the target language environment, fostering their ability to think and learn directly in the target language (Mellow, 2002). Demonstrations and the use of visual and physical aids to facilitate understanding are common tools in the direct method (Toreniyazova & Otegenova, 2022; Djauhar, 2021), especially suitable for learners from diverse national backgrounds where translating using a single auxiliary language is challenging and for materials featuring cultural characteristics of the target language.

In summary, principled eclecticism in teaching advocates that no single teaching method can achieve instructional effectiveness on its own. A flexible integration of the strengths of various teaching methods is recommended to tailor lesson plans to different teaching situations within the diverse atmosphere of foreign language classrooms. This approach aims to meet the varied characteristics and needs of learners, thereby maximizing learning outcomes and setting a trend for the development of foreign language teaching (Asif & Khan, 2022).

3.2 The application: An illustrative case of lesson plan design for Chinese language education

To ensure that Chinese language teaching remains represented in the global discourse on the application of principled eclecticism in foreign language teaching practice, this study builds upon the aforementioned theoretical foundations. Following the lesson plan template recommended by Cushing-Leubner & Bigelow (2014) and drawing on a Chinese textbook edited by Cai (2020), "Reading Taiwan, Learning Chinese," this paper outlines a principled eclectic lesson plan centered around Lesson Seven: "Hoping Sons Become Dragons and Daughters Become Phoenixes" (Table 1). This serves as a
guideline for practical teaching applications and the development of a checklist for principled eclectic Chinese language teaching.

Table 1

**Principled Eclectic Chinese Language Teaching Lesson Plan Design**


The implementation of principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching, as illustrated by the lesson plan design in Table 1, underscores a significant advancement in aligning teaching practices with the nuanced needs and diverse backgrounds of learners in the post-COVID-19 educational landscape. This approach, drawing upon the foundational theories espoused by Cushing-Leubner & Bigelow (2014) and the practical curriculum developments, emphasizes a strategic integration of various pedagogical methods to foster a dynamic and responsive learning environment for students at a B1 proficiency level.

Principled eclecticism, by design, accommodates the multifaceted objectives of language learning, encompassing cognitive, skill-based, and affective domains. The lesson plan outlined not only prioritizes linguistic competence, such as vocabulary, patterns, and grammar, but also delves into the cultural significances embedded within the Chinese language, illustrating a deep engagement with the educational values prevalent in Chinese society. This holistic approach resonates with the learners’ diverse motivations and experiences, facilitating a comprehensive understanding and appreciation of both the language and its cultural context.

Moreover, the integration of listening, speaking, reading, and writing activities within the lesson plan exemplifies the eclectic approach’s versatility, catering to different learning styles and reinforcing language skills through varied contexts. Activities such as group discussions, role-playing, and personalized writing tasks encourage active participation, critical thinking, and the practical application of learned concepts in real-world scenarios. These methodological choices not only enhance linguistic proficiency but also foster cultural awareness and personal growth among learners.

The emphasis on feedback and reflection within the lesson plan further illustrates principled eclecticism’s commitment to adaptive learning and teaching. By engaging students in the evaluation process and encouraging self-expression through creative assignments, the approach nurtures a learner-centered environment where feedback serves as a pivotal tool for continuous improvement and adaptation.

In essence, the application of principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching, as demonstrated through the detailed lesson plan, represents a sophisticated and evidence-based strategy to language education. It underscores the importance of a flexible, integrated, and learner-focused pedagogical framework that is capable of addressing the diverse needs of global learners. This approach not only maximizes educational outcomes but also aligns with contemporary trends in foreign language teaching, positioning it as a valuable model for academic and practical exploration within Chinese language education.

### 4 Research and Implications of Principled Eclecticism in Teaching

Including Chinese language instruction, dialogue plays a pivotal role in the foreign language learning process as a key to understanding the target language’s culture. Lyotard (1984) posited that denotative utterances are created among the sender, the addressee, and the referent, facilitating a space where each participant has the opportunity and freedom to express and validate knowledge through dialogue. For foreign language learners, engaging in dialogue facilitates the gradual comprehension of new languages and cultures (Fielding, 2021). Principled eclecticism, as a paradigm in foreign language education of this century, underscores the significance of interaction between teachers and students and peer discussions, aligning perfectly with the elements necessary for cultivating target language proficiency and cross-cultural understanding.

Recent studies have validated the effectiveness of principled eclecticism in foreign language learning. For instance, a three-month study integrating Systematic Communicative Language Teaching with Principled
Eclecticism Approaches to train students in English speech reporting revealed that continuous, systematic, and principled instructional guidance not only addressed common errors with present and past tenses but also significantly enhanced the students’ abilities to deliver English speeches (Tabiri, 2016).

Centering on student-focused learning, principled eclecticism combines various teaching methods and activities to offer diverse learning opportunities. Alharbi (2017) applied this approach in an English writing course at a Saudi Arabian university, finding that principled eclectic teaching facilitated systematic and logical organization of learning content. This approach enabled students to analyze the syntactic structure, functions, and pragmatic uses of English, and practice variations between written and spoken forms, proving beneficial for students’ English writing skills. However, Alharbi (2017) also reflected on how frequent teacher-student interaction might impact students’ creativity in writing, noting the necessity for instructors to invest extra effort in guiding students less inclined towards peer collaboration or not skilled in giving peer feedback.

To understand how English teachers apply principled eclecticism in designing assessments, Thamrin et al. (2023) conducted convenience sampling interviews with 16 high school English teachers. The findings suggested that thinking with principled eclecticism allows for diverse assessments, yet the capability to design assessments impacts the quality of the test items critically. Ghafar et al. (2023) analyzed literature from 2019 to 2023, indicating principled eclecticism’s effectiveness in enhancing learning experiences and communication skills, often integrating communicative language teaching, task-based learning, grammar translation teaching, and audio-lingual teaching.

Compared to the broader field of foreign language education, which explores issues of language ontology, motivation, and teaching methods, the discourse on principled eclecticism is still emerging. Its focus on systematically integrating various teaching methods based on learners’ characteristics, needs, and the teaching context to provide an attractive and effective learning experience has not only sparked discussions but also garnered research support. However, a review of the literature reveals a lack of specificity regarding the research tools and the treatment of data reliability and validity, critical factors influencing research quality (Ahmed & Ishtiaq, 2021; Mohajan, 2017). Checklists emerge as one method to ensure research quality (Yadav, 2022; Casey et al., 2023). Consequently, developing a checklist for principled eclectic Chinese language teaching is essential for future research and practical application in this nascent area of inquiry.

5 The Characteristics of Principled Eclecticism in Chinese Language Teaching and the Development of a Checklist

5.1 Characteristics of principled eclecticism

According to Cai (2022), a critical aspect of effectively implementing principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching lies in the teacher’s mastery of learners, learning theories, and pedagogical methods. This expertise enables the teacher to adapt flexibly within diverse and evolving teaching contexts and to select the most appropriate teaching methods for the classroom. This study synthesizes the essence, application, and research findings related to principled eclecticism, delineating the following distinctive features of principled eclectic Chinese language teaching:

5.1.1 Integration of various teaching methodologies’ strengths

Chinese language educators tailor second language teaching methods to the dynamic classroom environment, based on course objectives and the unique characteristics and needs of learners.

5.1.2 Understanding learner diversity

Echoing the sociological insights of Durkheim in "The Division of Labor In Society (De la division du travail social),” the increasingly intricate division of labor in society and the consequent busyness and social dependence of individuals underscore the importance of recognizing the multifaceted roles of learners, particularly adults, in their learning, living, and working spheres. This complex milieu necessitates that Chinese language education be designed to maximize learning outcomes within limited classroom time, addressing learners’
diverse needs and characteristics, thereby aligning with the principles of language economics (Ginsburgh & Weber, 2020).

5.1.3 Ensuring equitable and fair Chinese language education

Acknowledging differences in the perceptions of effective Chinese language teaching between instructors and students (Xie & Ziebart, 2022), principled eclecticism advocates for the integration of various teaching methods to accommodate individual learner differences, thereby minimizing learning disparities and ensuring educational equity.

5.1.4 Emphasizing cognitive learning

Rooted in cognitive learning theory, which values the attractiveness and relevance of learning content (Wichita State University, 2024), this approach prioritizes meaningful knowledge and skills over rote memorization, enabling learners to apply what they have learned effectively.

5.1.5 Following the Natural Language Acquisition Sequence

Listening, speaking, reading, and writing represent the natural sequence of language acquisition. Principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching focuses on a balanced development of comprehensive linguistic knowledge and skills, viewing the structure, function, and communicative activities of the Chinese language as an integrated whole, in harmony with the whole language concept proposed by Sukmayasa and Sudiana (2023).

5.1.6 Reflecting Real-World Experiences

According to Keller’s (2016) ARCS model of motivation, relevance is a crucial factor in stimulating learning motivation. Learning activities designed under the principled eclecticism framework should mirror real-world experiences, making Chinese language learning relevant to learners’ lives and ensuring tangible learning outcomes.

In the philosophical concept of ‘The mechanic, who wishes to do his work well, must first sharpen his tools. （工具善其是，Bi Xian Li Qi Qi）’ from Analects, Book 15, principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching serves as a powerful tool for enhancing teaching efficacy. To fully leverage this tool, cultivating teachers’ expertise in the professional knowledge of the Chinese language, embedding them in the rich cultural heritage and cross-cultural competencies, and fostering their ability to innovatively integrate teaching methods according to situational demands, emerges as a pivotal goal in Chinese language teacher education.

5.2 The development of a checklist for principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching

The concept of a checklist was introduced by Professor Osborn of Harvard University in 1953, aimed at enumerating possible cause-and-effect relationships for a given issue, facilitating systematic examination and discussion to prevent oversight. This tool has since been widely applied across various domains. In the context of research, listing evaluation indicators on a checklist aids researchers in standardizing the examination of raw data, thereby enhancing the reliability and validity of research outcomes (Protogerou & Hagger, 2020). This study synthesizes discussions on principled eclecticism, proposing a checklist derived from the teaching context’s aspects of learners, teaching materials and methods, and assessment evaluations. The checklist (Table 2) is intended for future academic research and practical teaching applications.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Understanding the personal backgrounds of Chinese language learners, including nationality, mother tongue, culture, and proficiency level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Observing the needs, motivations, characteristics, and styles of Chinese language learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Mastering the learning challenges of Chinese language learners in pronunciation, vocabulary, syntax, listening, speaking, reading, and writing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6 Conclusions and Recommendations

6.1 Conclusions

This study, informed by the problem statement and literature review, underscores the importance of developing a checklist for principled eclecticism in Chinese language teaching, both for advancing academic...
research and enhancing practical teaching applications. Drawing from the essence of principled eclecticism, relevant scholarly evaluations, and implications of associated research, this study has formulated a checklist that encapsulates a comprehensive perspective, customizable teaching strategies, objectivity in teaching assessments, and is underpinned by related research.

The checklist covers various aspects including learner backgrounds, needs, learning challenges, teaching goals, materials and methodologies, assessments, and the teaching environment. It enables Chinese language teachers to comprehensively understand student circumstances, allowing for timely and flexible adjustments to teaching methods. By following the indicators listed in the checklist, teachers can more accurately identify individual differences among students, such as cultural backgrounds and learning styles. This facilitates the tailoring of teaching plans to meet diverse student needs, characterizing customizable teaching. The indicators provide a set of assessment criteria, guiding instruction and enhancing the effectiveness of principled eclectic Chinese language teaching, characteristic of objectivized teaching assessments. Although this study has not conducted quantitative research or inferential statistical analysis, the checklist is preliminarily based on principled eclecticism and findings from other foreign language teaching research. It aligns with the learner-centered pedagogical approach in Chinese language teaching, considering individual learner backgrounds, diversity, and the dynamic changes in teaching contexts which influence Chinese language education. This not only aids teachers in effectively addressing these influencing factors but also features the support of related research.

6.2 Recommendations

The checklist for principled eclectic Chinese language teaching developed in this study could incorporate Likert item scoring for application in classroom teaching observations of Chinese language instruction. This would assess the micro-teaching sessions of students in Chinese language teaching programs and examine the extent to which Chinese language teachers implement principled eclectic teaching principles in their classrooms, serving as a reference for improving Chinese language teaching effectiveness.

In terms of research application, following Maxwell’s (2013) discussions on enhancing the validity of data analysis in qualitative research methodologies, it is recommended that future studies invite scholars and experts in related fields to review and revise the content validity of the checklist indicators. Subsequently, the revised checklist can be utilized in a Likert scale format for observing and assessing Chinese language teachers’ classroom instruction or for self-assessment by the teachers themselves. Gathering data from at least 200 samples (Alavi et al., 2020; Pacewicz et al., 2023) and employing statistical item analysis, exploratory factor analysis, internal consistency validity analysis, and confirmatory factor analysis would validate its reliability and validity. This developed research tool for assessing the implementation level of principled eclectic Chinese language teaching principles can then be applied in future research and teaching practices, making the theory-practice-integrated principled eclectic Chinese language teaching a paradigm in the international field of foreign language education.

References


